



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE  
ACTION  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Administrative  
Clerk (M0802S), Clark

CSC Docket No. 2019-146

Administrative Appeal

ISSUED: December 20, 2019 (SLD)

In *In the Matter of Administrative Clerk (M0802S), Clark* (CSC, decided November 10, 2016) (attached), the Civil Service Commission (Commission) granted the request of the Clark Public Library (Library) for an appointment waiver for the July 13, 2015 certification and ordered that no selection costs would be assessed at that time since there was a possibility that the list could be utilized prior to its expiration. However, the appointing authority did not utilize the subject eligible list and the matter of the assessment of costs is now before the Commission.

Thereafter, the Library was notified that since the eligible list was not utilized by its expiration date, the matter of the costs for the selection process in the amount of \$2,048 would be forwarded to the Commission for a determination. In response, the Library reiterates its prior arguments that the previous Library Director had incorrectly appointed an individual to the subject title, when the more appropriate title for the position was Account Clerk. Additionally, it asserts that the previous Library Director had only been in her position for a few months and relied heavily on the protocols set by the previous director. Moreover, the Library asserts that repaying the costs of the selection process would create a serious hardship as it would have to cut back on services to the public.

## CONCLUSION

*N.J.S.A.* 11A:4-5 and *N.J.A.C.* 4A:10-2.2(a)2 state that if an appointing authority receives permission not to make an appointment, it can be ordered to reimburse the costs of the selection process. While administering examinations and providing the names of eligible job candidates to the jurisdictions under the Civil Service system are two of the primary activities of this agency, these costly efforts are thwarted when appointing authorities fail to utilize the resulting eligible lists to make appointments and candidates have needlessly expended their time, effort and money to take these examinations in hopes of being considered for a permanent appointment. The amount of \$2,048 has been determined to be the cost of the selection process for open-competitive examinations for local government positions. In the instant situation, although the appointing authority had shown a valid reason for not making an appointment from the subject eligible list, it failed to provide a sufficient basis for not being charged for the costs of the selection process which produced the subject eligible list. In this regard, the appointing authority's appointment of an employee provisionally to the subject title, had caused an examination for the title of Administrative Clerk to be announced. Moreover, only after the certification was issued did the appointing authority request that it be cancelled. Furthermore, although the appointing authority had originally indicated that it might utilize the subject eligible list in the future, it failed to do so. Finally, although the Commission is sympathetic to the fiscal constraints faced by the Library, those constraints are no more significant than those faced by any other New Jersey municipal agency. Thus, it is appropriate that the appointing authority be assessed the costs of the selection process.

## ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that Clark Public Library be assessed the costs of the selection process in the amount of \$2,048 to be paid within 30 days of the issuance of this decision.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON  
THE 18TH DAY OF DECEMBER, 2019



Deirdre L. Webster Cobb  
Chairperson  
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries  
and  
Correspondence

Christopher Myers  
Director  
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs  
Civil Service Commission  
Written Record Appeals Unit  
P.O. Box 312  
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

c: Megan Kociolek  
Kelly Glenn  
Records Center



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Administrative  
Clerk (M0802S), Clark

Appointment Waiver Request

CSC Docket No. 2016-1645

ISSUED: NOV 15 2016 (SLD)

Clark Public Library (Library) requests permission not to make an appointment from the July 13, 2015 certification for Administrative Clerk (M0802S), Clark.

The record reveals that the appointing authority provisionally appointed Charlene Hayden part-time, pending open-competitive examination procedures to the title of Administrative Clerk, effective February 18, 2014. As a result of the provisional appointment, an examination was announced with a closing date of December 4, 2014. Thirty-eight applicants, including Hayden were admitted to the written examination which was held on June 18, 2015. The resulting eligible list of 23 names, including Hayden as the fifth ranked eligible, promulgated on July 9, 2015 and expires on July 8, 2018. The appointing authority took no action to obviate the need for the examination at the time of the announcement or prior to the administration of the examination. On July 13, 2015, the names of five eligibles were certified from the subject eligible list. The appointing authority initially returned the certification requesting the removal of three of the eligibles for not meeting the requirements of the position and one for failing to complete preemployment processing. The appointing authority also indicated that Hayden was to be appointed, effective August 4, 2015. The Division of Agency Services (DAS) notified the appointing authority that it could not remove the eligibles for not meeting the requirements, since all three had met the announced requirements for the position. Thereafter, the appointing authority returned the certification, indicating that no appointments would be made and requested an appointment waiver.

In its request for an appointment waiver, the appointing authority asserted that historically, the position at issue had been filled by an individual in the title of Account Clerk. However, the previous administration changed the title of the position to Administrative Clerk. The appointing authority maintains that upon the new administration taking control, it merely "kept" the same titles for the positions. It was only after the list was certified that it realized that the title of Administrative Clerk was not the correct title for the position. In this regard, it noted that none of the eligibles, except for Hayden, had any knowledge of modern office methods, such as Excel and cloud-based accounting software; experience with reporting to a Board of Trustees; and human resource administration experience. Additionally, the appointing authority asserted that it does not have the ability to pay any fines as it would be forced to cut programming and reduce its materials budget to pay for any fine.

The appointing authority's request for an appointment waiver was acknowledged, and it was advised that if its request were granted, it could be assessed for the costs of the selection process in the amount of \$2,048. In response, the appointing authority reiterates that it merely appointed Hayden to the title that the previous administration had utilized for the position, and did not realize that the title was not appropriate for the financial records management duties performed by an incumbent in the position. Additionally, it maintains that if it is required to pay costs in the amount of \$2,048, it will be unable to hire a part-time children's librarian this year.

Agency records reveal that Hayden was appointed to the non-competitive title of Account Clerk, on a part-time hourly basis, effective January 7, 2016. Agency records further reveal that there are no employees serving in the subject title with the appointing authority. However, there is currently one individual serving permanently in the title of Administrative Clerk with the Township of Clark.

A review of the job specification for Administrative Clerk reveals that an individual in that title assists an administrative official of a department or autonomous government agency at a level no lower than department head, by doing administrative clerical and related work, usually varied and involving some elements of trouble shooting; or, under the immediate direction of an administrative official at a level no lower than department head, supervises the office and other clerical and related operations of a department or autonomous agency. The requirement for the title of Administrative Clerk is five years of experience in clerical work. The successful completion of a two-year college level course in secretarial science may be substituted for two years of the indicated experience.

A review of the job specification for Account Clerk reveals that an individual in that title performs a variety of routine, repetitive, noncomplex clerical tasks

which involve computing, classifying, verifying, and recording numerical data and the reconciliation of accounts, records, and documents to keep sets of financial records complete.

### CONCLUSION

In accordance with *N.J.S.A.* 11A:4-5, once the examination process has been initiated due to the appointment of a provisional employee or due to an appointing authority's request for a list to fill a vacancy, the appointing authority must make an appointment from the resulting eligible list if there are three or more interested and eligible candidates. The only exception to this mandate may be made for a valid reason such as fiscal constraints.

In the instant matter, the examination for the title of Administrative Clerk was generated as a result of the provisional appointment of Hayden. After a complete certification was issued, the appointing authority appointed Hayden to the non-competitive title of Account Clerk. A review of the relevant job specifications indicates that an individual in the title of Account Clerk performs different duties than an individual in the title of Administrative Clerk. Moreover, agency records reveal that there are no employees serving in the subject title with the appointing authority. Accordingly, based on the foregoing, there is sufficient justification for an appointment waiver.

Although the appointment waiver is granted, both *N.J.S.A.* 11A:4-5 and *N.J.A.C.* 4A:10-2.2(a)2 state that if an appointing authority receives permission not to make an appointment, it can be ordered to reimburse the costs of the selection process. While administering examinations and providing the names of eligible job candidates to the jurisdictions under the Civil Service system are two of the primary activities of this agency, these costly efforts are thwarted when appointing authorities fail to utilize the resulting eligible lists to make appointments and candidates have needlessly expended their time, effort and money to take these examinations in hopes of being considered for a permanent appointment. In the instant situation, the appointing authority simply stated that Hayden was no longer serving in the subject title and that due to fiscal constraints it was unable to pay for the costs of the examination process. However, the Civil Service Commission notes that the list in question will not expire until July 8, 2018. Further, the record reveals that although there is currently no one serving in the subject title with the Clark Public Library, the title is utilized by the Township of Clark. Moreover, the subject eligible list is available for use by the Township of Clark. Accordingly, under the particular circumstances of this matter, it would not be appropriate to assess the appointing authority for the costs of the selection process *at this time*. See e.g., *In the Matter of Supervising Administrative Analyst (PS1837I), Department of Corrections* (MSB, decided March 22, 2006) (Not appropriate to assess the Department of Corrections for the costs of the selection process since it had


indicated its intention to utilize the eligible list prior to its expiration date). Nevertheless, in the event that this appointing authority, or the Township of Clark, fails to utilize the list by its expiration date of July 8, 2018, this matter can be reviewed to ascertain whether an assessment for the costs of the selection process should be made. See e.g., *In the Matter of Supervising Administrative Analyst (PS1837I), Department of Corrections* (MSB, decided April 11, 2007) (Costs assessed upon the expiration of the eligible list since the Department of Corrections failed to utilize the eligible list and there was no evidence that it had even attempted to utilize the eligible list).

**ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that the appointment waiver be granted and no selection costs presently be assessed.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

**DECISION RENDERED BY THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON  
THE 10TH DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2016**

  
Robert M. Czech  
Chairperson  
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries  
and  
Correspondence

Director  
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs  
Civil Service Commission  
Written Record Appeals Unit  
P.O. Box 312  
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Dawn S. Jenkin  
Kelly Glenn  
Records Center  
Diane Lukasewycz